

# Constructing Rubrics and Criteria Cards to Challenge Gifted Students

Carolyn Coil  
Educational Consultant and Author  
Pieces of Learning, 1990 Market Road, Marion, IL 62959

Publisher's Website: [www.piecesoflearning.com](http://www.piecesoflearning.com)  
Website: [www.carolyncoil.com](http://www.carolyncoil.com) Email: [carolyncoil@comcast.net](mailto:carolyncoil@comcast.net)

---

## Developing Assessment Criteria

Nearly all student projects, products and performances could be assessed in a multitude of different ways. It is up to the teacher to *look at the standards* and then *determine the significant learning outcomes* for each piece of student work. This provides a focus and direction for the student and gives the teacher a concrete way to assess what each student does. These outcomes can be differentiated for gifted students to focus on higher level thinking and in-depth learning.

The first step is to decide on the assessment criteria you want to use for each product or performance your students do. Sometime you will use these to develop a simple assessment checklist. At other time these will become the criteria for your rubrics. Ask yourself: *"Can I picture what I want this product to look like?"* If you can, developing assessment criteria is merely putting the picture into words.

**Example**  
*Make a collage of 20<sup>th</sup> century inventions*

Standards/Learning outcomes:

---

---

---

Criteria for assessment:

- 1.
- 2.
- 3.
- 4.
- 5.
- 6.
- 7.
- 8.
- 9.
- 10.

## Product Criteria Cards

You may have the same generic criteria for certain products or performances regardless of the specific academic content they cover. When this is the case, consider developing criteria cards to use every time students do the same type of product.

Product Criteria Card
1.
2.
3.
4.

To schedule a workshop call  
Emily at 1-800-729-5137

## Product Criteria Cards

<p><b>Brochure</b></p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Pictures relate to topic</li> <li>2. Attractive and neat layout</li> <li>3. Folded with information on each panel</li> <li>4. Neat and clear writing highlighting important points</li> <li>5. Correct spelling</li> </ol>	<p><b>Concept Map/Web</b></p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Has major topic in center</li> <li>2. Shows details about the topic with lines and/or circles radiating from the center</li> <li>3. Visually shows relationships of details or ideas to one another</li> <li>4. Neat and legible</li> </ol>
<p><b>Cartoon</b></p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Conveys a message</li> <li>2. Clear writing with correct spelling</li> <li>3. Neatly drawn</li> <li>4. Humorous</li> <li>5. Creative and original</li> </ol>	<p><b>Crossword Puzzle</b></p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Each word intersects with another in at least one space</li> <li>2. Correct spelling</li> <li>3. Accurate definitions indicating across and down</li> <li>4. Neatly and clearly done</li> </ol>
<p><b>Chart</b></p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Well-organized sections divided by lines</li> <li>2. Clear and neat writing</li> <li>3. Has a title and sub-titles</li> <li>4. Accurate information</li> <li>5. Correct spelling</li> </ol>	<p><b>Diorama</b></p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Realistic depiction of scene</li> <li>2. Sides have background scenery</li> <li>3. 3-dimensional figures/objects in foreground</li> <li>4. Durable construction</li> <li>5. Accurate</li> </ol>
<p><b>Collage</b></p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Has a solid backing</li> <li>2. Visually attractive and neat</li> <li>3. Pictures overlap</li> <li>4. Creative and original</li> <li>5. Has title/labels spelled correctly</li> </ol>	<p><b>Drawing</b></p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Pictures are clear and understandable</li> <li>2. Neatly done</li> <li>3. Shows topic accurately</li> </ol>
<p><b>Comic Book/Comic Strip</b></p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Frames in correct sequence</li> <li>2. Tells story or idea through pictures</li> <li>3. Characters/objects clearly drawn</li> <li>4. Clear writing with correct spelling</li> <li>5. Humor</li> <li>6. Original and creative</li> </ol>	<p><b>Flowchart</b></p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Has items in sequential order</li> <li>2. Shows relationship between items by use of arrows or lines</li> <li>3. Labels and items are neatly written</li> <li>4. Short explanation of each item</li> </ol>

## Writing Rubrics

A *rubric* is a set of descriptive guidelines used to assess and give scores to student work.

**Complex rubrics** come with boxes and descriptors for each level. A typical complex rubric:

- Contains a scale of possible points and /or categories to be assigned for varying degrees of mastery or quality.
- States the different traits or criteria to be examined in the product or performance.
- Provides pointers for assessing each of the traits and finding the right place on the scoring scale to which a particular student's work corresponds.

Students should know exactly what the criteria and rubrics are, and teachers ought to be teaching directly to these criteria if the outcomes inherent in the task are worthwhile. **Criteria cards** can be included as one of the items in the rubric. With gifted and other high ability students, always include an **extension** column in your rubric. This indicates that there is more they can do and learn the specific assignment requires.

A good rubric helps teachers grade all types of products and performances more fairly since rubrics require teachers to be much more precise about what their expectations are. Rubrics give students an understanding of the meaning behind the grade. Rubrics can be developed by the teacher or by the students themselves. Developing the rubric is a great way to show students what makes an excellent product or performance.

A *generalized example* of a scoring scale with performance levels and standards is as follows:

- 1 = The learning activity / project was attempted, but it was not done correctly or completely.
- 2 = The learning activity / project was worked on, but it needs redirection, more detail, more information or different strategies and approaches.
- 3 = For the most part, the learning activity / project was completed. Minor problems remain.
- 4 = The learning activity / project was fully accomplished and done well.
- 5 = The learning activity / project was fully achieved and **extended** beyond the requirements or standards.

In this scale, 5 is especially important for gifted and high achieving students who always get A's on assignments without putting forth much effort. This challenges them to think and learn at a level appropriate for them.

### Guidelines for a Good Rubric:

1. Is understandable to the student
2. Can be used by the student as a guide for doing quality work
3. Challenges students to go beyond expectations or standards
4. Can be used by the teacher to grade coherently and fairly
5. Can be used to defend the grade if questioned by a student or parent

### Suggested Points for Rubrics

Make sure your points work so that you give students a passing grade when they turn something in and you have accepted it. In a rubric with four assessment criteria and five columns, you may want to make the "1" column worth 15 points for each block (60 total), the "2" column worth 18 points for each block (72 total), the "3" column worth 21 points for each block (84 total), the "4" column worth 24 points for each block (96 total). Use the remaining 4 points for the extension column (100 total).

### Suggested Resources from Pieces of Learning (Visit our conference Exhibit Booth)

*Product Criteria Cards* by Carolyn Coil & Dodie Merritt

*Products Tool Bag – K-1, 2-3, 4-5* by Joan Brownlee

*Solving the Assessment Puzzle* by Carolyn Coil & Dodie Merritt

*Successful Teaching in the Differentiated Classroom* by Carolyn Coil

# Rubric - Chart of Character Traits: Greek God or Goddess and Famous Person Today

**NAME:**

**DATE:**

**Standards/Outcomes:**

1. Show understanding of how Greek mythology has made an impact on current thinking.
2. Analyze character traits of a character in a Greek myth.
3. Organize, write, and present ideas.

**C  
R  
I  
T  
E  
R  
I  
A**

	<b>1</b>	<b>2</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>4</b>	<b>5</b> <b>Extension</b>
Identifies Greek god/goddess and famous person of today and lists similar character traits.	Identifies only god or goddess but not famous person. 1-2 character traits.	Identifies god/goddess and famous person and 1-2 character traits.	Identifies god/goddess and famous person and 3-4 character traits.	Identifies god/goddess and famous person and 5 or more character traits.	Everything in #4 PLUS identifies unusual/unique traits that both have.
Gives examples of each trait for both the Greek god/goddess and the famous person of today.	Has 1-2 examples for famous person or the god/goddess but not both.	Has 1-2 examples for famous person and the god/goddess.	Has 3-4 examples for famous person and the god/goddess.	Examples for each of the 5 or more traits for god/goddess and for famous person.	Gives little known examples; links traits of both in uncommon ways.
Indicates which traits are strengths and which are weaknesses.	Indicates strengths or weaknesses for 1-2 traits but doesn't explain why.	Indicates strengths or weaknesses for 1-2 traits and explains why.	Indicates strengths or weaknesses for 3-4 traits and explains why.	Explains each of the 5 or more traits as a strength or weakness and indicates why.	Explains each of the 5 or more traits as both a strength and a weakness and indicates why.
Follows Chart criteria card.	Has 1 item on criteria card.	Has 2 items on criteria card.	Has 3 items on criteria card.	Has all 4 items on criteria card.	Visually striking chart; extremely detailed and understandable.
				<b>Grade</b>	